

# Sustaining Development Through Social Capital Among Tribes: Analysing State-Civil Society Interaction in Inclusive Governance

Vikram Singh\*

## Abstract

State-civil society interaction can be a promoter of development. 'The norms of cooperation and a network of civic engagement among citizens can be promoted by state institutions and used for developmental ends'.<sup>1</sup> This argument is related to the two contemporary theories of development (state-led development) and social capital (civil society-centred development). 'The developmental state perspective argues that the autonomous developmental oriented state with competent bureaucracy and weak civil society is responsible for a high level of economic and social development within a short span of time in countries like China and South East Asian countries'.<sup>2</sup>

The developmentally orientated political elite in these countries choose authoritarian political management to achieve superior performance and thereby legitimacy. The leadership in China and South East Asia is repressive (i.e. it forms its individual set of laws in the concentration of the mass) and compassionate (i.e. had the purpose of doing utmost welfare of citizens). The majority of the society realistically anticipates from an egalitarian approach to be translucent, ordered and decision-making, which will be comprehensive, liable and endow with realistic constant and permissible outcomes for sustainable development, which stay beneath check.

In case of India, it can be analysed that India's democratic institutions were meticulously build over long years of the national movement for independence, with a distant-sighted idea and a contemporary, secular worldview, which was an attempt has been made to construct structures that would poise each other and give justice to tribal community, within this worldview which were comprised not only the legislature, executive and judiciary, but also an assortment of independent commissions and tribunals and media institutions. In accumulation, a range was provided for the execution of citizens and civil society groups and democratic people's movements. For

over three decades, inclusive governance comprises these two institutions that have survived as a framework within which tribal population is moving towards development. Hence, this paper attempts to study the sustenance of development vis-à-vis social capital and its various dimensions. It also looks into the initiatives taken economically, politically, and socially by Civil Society Organisations, which bring tribal community people together.

**Keywords:** Sustaining Development, Social Capital, Tribes, State-Civil Society Interaction, Inclusive Governance

## Introduction

This paper is trying to find out the relationship between the state and civil society organizations which is complimentary and promotes inclusive governance by developing social capital among disadvantaged groups specifically tribal community. Inclusive policies (reflecting the preferences, needs and rights of citizens particularly disadvantaged groups) can be effectively formulated and implemented in both the collaborative and contesting State-Civil society collaboration. This can be seen in the context of developing social capital (in the network of an association or an autonomous and democratic civil society) which is helpful for inclusive governance. The overall objective of this paper is to get an insight into the plights of tribal community, support of civil society organization and institution building and how they influence pro-active policy, strategies and legislation (with special reference to tribal community and their rehabilitation.) for enhancing rights, entitlements and the development of social capital among them throughout the process.

\* Assistant Professor and Head, Department of Social Work, Guru Ghasidas University (A Central University), Chhattisgarh, India. Email: [vsvikkyingsh@gmail.com](mailto:vsvikkyingsh@gmail.com)

## Tribes in India

‘The scheduled tribes, the ethnic minority groups in India, constitute around 8.6 per cent of the total population. There are 705 Scheduled Tribes living in different parts of the country (Census, 2011)’.<sup>3</sup> Since the tribal communities reside in the remote interiors which are inaccessible they remain underdeveloped they are found to live in small habitations without basic infrastructures. Besides, they have their own structural impediments which make them deprived and excluded with regard to almost everything that exists in contemporary mainstream society. The Simon Commission in 1935 first coined the term ‘Scheduled Tribes’.

‘All the untouchable castes, which were listed in 1931-Census of India, came to be known as the ‘Scheduled Tribes’ (STs) through the Government of India Act of 1935’ (Praveen Jadhav, 2008). ‘In the meantime, the Government published a list of Scheduled Tribes under the Government of India (Scheduled Tribes) Order, 1936’ (Praveen Jadhav, 2008). ‘The Constitution of India, under article 341(1), the President of India, after consultation with the Governor, may specify the castes, races, tribes or parts of groups within castes or races, which shall be deemed to be Scheduled Tribes’ (ref)<sup>4</sup> (ref).

Accordingly, the President has notified the Scheduled Tribes in the order called ‘Constitution (Scheduled Tribes) Order-1950’ and the ‘Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribes List (Modification) Order-1956’. However, under article 341(2), the Parliament of India by law can include or exclude the above-mentioned groups from the list of the Scheduled Tribes.

‘In a simple way, in the contemporary period, the Scheduled Tribes are defined under article 366 (244) of the Constitution of India as; the Scheduled Tribes means such Castes, Races, Tribes or parts of or groups within such Castes, races or tribes, deemed under article 341 to be Scheduled Tribes for the purpose of this Constitution’ (Praveen Jadhav, 2008). ‘Thus; the term Scheduled Tribes first appeared in the Constitution of India. Article 366 (25) of Indian Constitution describe scheduled tribes as the centre of population or element of society or cluster within the society as a whole. Hence tribal population is considered as Aboriginal Hindus under Article 342 of Indian Constitution to be Scheduled or Enumerated for

the purposes of the constitution to make it’s all citizens inclusive’. ‘Article 342, which is reproduced below, prescribes the procedure to be followed in the matter of specification of scheduled tribes’.<sup>5</sup>

Therefore, tribes are cluster of populace, usually live at the outskirts of society (i.e. forest), in a diminutive hamlet or clan, with low literacy, less economic sufficiency, barely dressed in clothes, generally dark and weak, totally residing within their ghettos whose marriage are endogamous themselves, they occupied in hunting and dependent on forest resources completely unaware of the State’s political and economic stipulation, resisting all efforts of development and have a well-built abhor for strangers and learned contemporary community.

‘Article 366 (25) of the Constitution of India refers to Scheduled Tribes as those communities, who are scheduled in accordance with Article 342 of the Constitution. This Article says that only those communities who have been declared as such by the President through an initial public notification or through a subsequent amending Act of Parliament will be considered to be Scheduled Tribes’.<sup>6</sup>

The Constitution of the Indian Republic recognized a total of 645 district tribes. And today we can see that the population of Scheduled Tribes in India are 104, 281, 034 of male 5, 24, 09,823 and female 5, 18, 71,211 (Census 2011). The Constitution of India incorporates several special provisions for the promotion of the educational and economic interest of Scheduled Tribes and their protection from social injustice and all forms of exploitation.

‘Tribal Population is one of the excluded group of citizens in India who in spite of having an exceptional facilitative stipulation for them in Indian Constitution under legislative frame for the execution of these necessities and numerous besieged public policy initiatives, they have unremitting sufferings which deprived them in of different public spheres. In other words, the rights guaranteed to the tribal population have been grossly violated. The tribal population not only face severe socio-economic marginalization but also the threat of undermining of their distinctive culture and identity, which in turn is rooted in their livelihood patterns.’<sup>7</sup>

Closely bound up with the demands for justice by many disempowered groups is a demand for recognition of the intrinsic worth of all human beings but also recognition

of and respect for their differences. It is people's ability to exercise some degree of control over their lives. Where rights are seen to promote the capacity for self-determination, the struggle for rights is expressed in ways that reflect the particular experience of being denied self-determination.

'Charred defines justice as bringing about more equitable relations among different communities with the implication that this community people defined as equal citizens with equal autonomy and rights in the social order. Fears are manipulated to subdue societies into obedience and conformity'. The ideals of liberty and social, political equality are being undermined. There is a number of unexplored areas of concern of the people's or what we can exactly call them citizens of a political community; i.e. victims of communal atrocities, women, lower castes and other marginalised sections. It has become clear, however, that many groups, such as tribal communities all feel excluded from the 'common culture' despite possessing the common rights of the citizen.

Thus, political inequality operating through these structures limits the possibility of actors engaging actively in the public sphere, for accessing their rights. Inequality among tribes in the present-day articulation can be traced as of state-society relations, relations based on particularistic and ascribed identities of religion and kin-based formations.

### **Inclusive Governance**

'Inclusive Governance has gained prominence in the last two decades owing to increasing political demands from citizens, civil society and some political parties. The changes have however been achieved in an ad hoc manner and not institutionalised within the public sector'.<sup>8</sup>

The participation of citizens facilitates governance to expand larger approval and undertake new issues. In command to reach the most satisfactory decision, a three-step decision-making process can be implemented:

- Information has to be discussed with the citizens or beneficiaries.
- Consulting the beneficiary group at each and every step by taking their opinion on each and every issue.

- Dialogue or discussion has to be initiated among all actors along-with stakeholders on the basis of outcome with a participatory approach. Any society including tribal society from a democratic approach expects that it should be an open, transparent and structured decision-making process which should be reasonable and appropriate for inclusiveness vis-à-vis accountable which provides consistent and justifiable outcomes which remain under review in case of tribal society. Within this, the roles, responsibilities, rights and any limitations on influence or authority of individual or groups of stakeholders need to be clearly and publicly set out. In case of India it can be analysed that India's democratic institutions were meticulously build over long years of the national movement for independence, with a distant sighted idea and a contemporary, secular worldview, which was an attempt has been made to construct structures that would poise each other and give justice to the tribal community, within this worldview which were comprised not only the legislature, executive and judiciary, but also an assortment of independent commissions and tribunals and media institutions. In accumulation, the range was provided for the execution of citizens and civil society groups and democratic people's movements for over three decades these institutions survived as a framework within which tribal population is moving towards sustainable development vis-à-vis Social Capital.

### **Civil Society Organisations**

'India is the largest democracy in the world. But without its lively civil society, many ills in society would continue unchallenged. Civil society constitutes diverse agencies, advocacy groups, activists, professionals which form the network to bring social mobilization and good governance for the fulfilment of people's rights. Civil society as one of the stakeholders of development plays an influential role in public policies, programs and fulfilling entitlement of social, economic and political rights of the people. 'At an elementary level, the concept of civil society pinpoints and values associational life- interest group professional and other associations, voluntary agencies, grass root organizations, social movements and all other social

orders- because it brings people together in networks and shared concerns.’<sup>9</sup>

‘In India, during the few last decades, political scientists have been repeatedly pointing to the declining legitimacy of the state. ‘Commenting on the social and political erosion in the country in the late 1980’s Kothari highlighted the polarization between a state increasingly unwilling to carry out its constitutional obligations and a people not knowing who else to turn to and identified this polarization as setting the stage for the growing incidence of violence, injustice, destruction of moderate modes of dissent and articulation of people’s discontent and disenchantment.’<sup>10</sup>

In the era of globalization, the role of civil society in governance sphere in present times has turned into the room for the multifarious interplay between society, state and market as a pressure group. ‘Plodding abandonment of the State from the fiscal dome and the substantial set-of the public liberty evacuation by the state by the inclusive capital have lead to an rising emphasis by the subaltern groups for the state to participate in overriding and receptive role inside the frame of sustainable development and egalitarian contribution’ (Mohanty, 2000).

## Non-Government Organisations

Non-Government Organizations are also essential actors of Inclusive governance as they are used as a synonym or an integral part of civil society organizations. The word NGO becomes trendy in India after the 1980s hence the voluntary area has an older practice in the Indian context. Ever since freedom from the British in 1947, the voluntary sector had an assortment of admiration in the minds of people - because the Gandhi was a dynamic participant of this sector; and second India has always had the practice of reverence persons who have made some forfeit to help others.

‘In sovereign India, the preliminary function occupied by the voluntary organizations was initiated to bridge the breach missed by the administration in the enlargement progression’<sup>11</sup>.

‘The volunteers (by Pradan NGO) engaged planning in Kerala has targeted villages of handloom weavers to form cooperatives through which they could promote and sell

their goods directly in the urban area, and therefore get an improved price’ (Srinivas, 2006).

‘Alike cooperatives were afterwards also started in many parts of India in fields related to promotion of dairy products and fisheries’<sup>12</sup>.

Approximately in every case, the volunteers have facilitated in every area of inclusive development – (i.e. Adult and Extension Education), for e.g. in the 80s, though, the groups who were now recognized as NGOs became more specific, and the voluntary movement has in a way forward which has been split into three major groups.

There were those considered the traditional development NGOs, who went into a village or a group of villages and ran literacy programmes, crèches’ for children and clinics, encouraged farmers to experiment with new crops and livestock breeds that would bring more money, helped the weavers and other village artisans market their products and so on - in short, became almost a part of the community in their chosen area (usually in rural India) and tried to fill all the gaps left in the development process by the government. There are numerous examples of voluntary associations of this type operating incredibly and productively in India for the last five decades. ‘Cluster of NGOs was those who researched a scrupulous topic in depth, and then lobbied with the government or with industry or petitioned the courts for improvements in the lives of the citizens, as far as that particular subject was concerned’<sup>13</sup>.

All NGOs undertake an assured quantity of activism to get their points transversely – as they petitioned the bureaucrats; they attentive the media when they found somewhat wrong and so on.

But this third faction of NGOs saw activism as their key means for the attainment of their objectives since they did not deem that they might get the establishment to shift in any other way. In an underdeveloped nation like India, there are many breaches missed by the administration in the development discourse- occasionally by intention, sometimes be deficient in of funds, and many times lack attentiveness or ignorance. These are the gaps that many NGOs try to fill in modern India. Several of them may effort in part in which government does not want to get

into - like combating against inequity on the basis of caste/class/gender/religion.

Most Indian politicians do not really want to upset the existing caste hierarchy in his or her constituency because the politician is dependent for votes on the dominant castes of that particular constituency. In the process, laws prohibiting discrimination on the basis of caste are often ignored unless these NGOs are working in the area that is willing to take up the cause of those being discriminated against.

## Social Capital

‘Social capital refers to the institutions, relationships, and norms that shape the quality and quantity of a society’s social interactions (Tsujinaka, 2002). ‘Increasing evidence shows that social cohesion is critical for societies to prosper economically and for development to be sustainable’<sup>14</sup>.

‘Social capital is not just the sum of the institutions which underpin a society – it is the glue that holds them together’ (Peter, 2000). A narrow view of social capital regards it as a set of horizontal associations between people, consisting of social networks and associated norms that have an effect on community productivity and well-being.

Social networks can increase productivity by reducing the costs of doing business. Social capital facilitates coordination and cooperation. Social capital also has an important “downside” (Portes and Landholt 1996), communities, groups or networks which are isolated, parochial, or working at cross-purposes to society’s collective interests (e.g. drug cartels, corruption rackets) can actually hinder economic and social development. ‘A broader understanding of social capital accounts for both the positive and negative aspects by including vertical as well as horizontal associations between people and includes behaviour within and among organizations, such as firms’ (Dalkir, 2017).

‘This view recognizes that horizontal ties are needed to give communities a sense of identity and common purpose, but also stresses that without “bridging” ties that transcend various social divides’ (Helen M. Wallace, 2003). (e.g. ‘religion, ethnicity, socio-economic status), horizontal ties can become a basis for the pursuit of narrow interests, and can actively preclude access to information

and material resources that would otherwise be of great assistance to the tribal community’ (Monditoka, 2010).

## Role of Civil Society Organisations in Sustaining Development vis-à-vis Social Capital Among Tribes

‘Studies have shown that the role of civil society groups is vital in the political, social and economic development of African countries (see Diamond, 1999; Ndegwa, 1996; Yohannes, 1997; and Gyimah-Boadi, 2004). According to Yohannes (1997), this role can be viewed from three dimensions. First, improving the quality of governance; second, developing the capacity of governments to apply the principles of accountability, transparency and openness; third, working towards gaining the commitment of all elected officials, public servants, and NGOs to good governance.’<sup>15</sup>

In view of this, one can infer that CSOs have contributed immensely to democratic consolidation and sustainable development among tribal communities.

‘One other aspect is plateful to elucidate the previously inhibited model of civil society in the development sector in the third world which is the altering approach in development policy and development ideology. In the midst of 1950s and 1960s, enlargement idea emphasizes on the significance of a State as the key representative of modernizing reforms. As an outcome, significant attempts went into the distinguished sphere of State accomplishment at the outer surface of pre-modern structures of tribal communities, and in the construction of contemporary, secular administrative structure that could efficiently control this sphere. This expanded construction includes an area of trade in addition to government, but it downplayed, if not debarred, hence CSOs were view as the only subsidiary in the edge of affairs. Social capital consists of institutions, relationships, and norms that shape the quality and quantity of this community social interactions leading towards collective interests, civic commitment and enhancement of democracy in view of understanding the snag.

‘An active civil society can create social capital, that is, trust, cooperation over ethnic, religious, and other divisions, inclusiveness, and open debate which is conducive to peace and harmony between sections

of society (see Putnam 1993). Interaction over ethnic and religious boundaries and inclusiveness in ways of organizing and associating can serve to prevent violence (Varshney 2002). ‘Civil society can play a positive role in maintaining sustainable peace as civil society is a critical space where diversity and pluralism could be cherished and fostered (Hampson 1996: 7, Peck 1998).’<sup>16</sup>

‘Putnam’s main thesis was that it was in these voluntary, “horizontal” networks that citizens develop the trust, cooperative skills, and egalitarian attitudes required for democracy (Hefner 2005, 16). However, “the idea that all civil society associations and all social capital are “good” for democracy runs up against one unnerving complication: social capital can be used for all manner of ends, including anti-democratic ones” (Hefner 2005, 16).’<sup>17</sup>

World Bank and other actors to discuss the link between social capital and growth, social capital and education through its relationship with human capital, social capital and democracy through the commitment level of the citizen and social capital and level of investment. Now a day’s civil society is at the centre of the formulation of public opinion which according to Gandhi is the temperature of the society and civil society through its resource mobilization capacity, also be a centre of interest.

## Conclusion

Tribal community and CSOs/NGOs who are participating had a different level of consciousness. There are different agendas and different lens to analyze and believe/disbelieve in the process of Sustaining Development vis-à-vis social capital. On one hand, CSOs/NGOs have a point of disagreement with the process but they also have ways to contribute meaningfully e.g. consultation meetings, status, work of the organization within the ambit of civil society makes them more responsible entities to raise their voice for agreement or disagreement with the movement. Whereas; general tribal communities attracted by the strategies of the developmental process. Among the tribal group some level of consciousness, critical analysis and awareness are there but they are not aware of the multiple realities. They have focus understanding of different approaches and bringing tribal participation from all sections of the tribal society, therefore the role of civil society becomes extremely crucial and responsible. This

paper itself is revealing multiple realities. CSOs/NGO’s have the knowledge, skills and competency to make an informed choice. There is the difference in opinion of larger civil society. One section of civil society is leading, organizing and promoting the movement, where there is a lack of comprehensive and critical analysis of diverse tribal society and the importance of their true involvement in the movement. The other sections of civil society can critically analyze multiple realities but still, there is a gap to come together. This also reflects how larger civil society or all sections of civil society, needs to develop, democratic responsible and just culture within them.

What is required in the context of Indian tribal situation is the conscientisation of the tribes through the development of social capital which helps them about their latent capacities and to motivate them for acquiring a better life. In long-term, the tribal community should be prepared as a self-relevant or self-reliant through socialization process vis-à-vis imparting training. CSOs/NGOs can contribute in a positive way to the development of tribal health and in the protection of their indigenous knowledge base which is either ignored or exploited as we all know that the tribes have the keys to biologically diverse areas. They have a profound knowledge of the flora and fauna, the appropriate plant species with medical importance, their location, the parts to be used, time of collection, preparation and administration of the same.

## References and Notes

- Census of India (2011). Release of Primary Census Abstract data Highlights. P. 3.
- Chandoke, N. (2003). Civil society as the ‘Third Sphere’: Tandon Rajesh and Mohanty Ranjita eds. (2003). *Does civil society matter? Governance in contemporary India*, Sage Publication New Delhi.
- Dalkir, K. (2017). *Knowledge management in theory and practice* (3rd ed.). Cambridge, Massachusetts, London, UK: The MIT Press .
- Evans, P. (1996). Government action, social capital and development: Reviewing the evidence on synergy. *World Development*, 24(6), 1119-1132.
- Helen, M., & Wallace, G. G. (2003). *Health and welfare for families in the 21st Century* (2nd ed.). Sudbury, Massachusetts London, UK: Jonnes and Bartlett, .
- [http://afrevjo.net/journals/multidiscipline/vol\\_8\\_no\\_1\\_art\\_14.pdf](http://afrevjo.net/journals/multidiscipline/vol_8_no_1_art_14.pdf).

- <http://oaji.net/articles/2016/3041-1455606592.pdf>
- <http://tribal.nic.in/Content/DefinitionProfiles.aspx>, Retrieved on 24/12/2014 at 11:00 hrs.
- <http://tribal.nic.in/Content/IntroductionScheduledTribes.aspx>/Retrieved on dated 05/09/2014. 10:40pm
- <http://unpan1.un.org/intradoc/groups/public/documents/un/unpan019594.pdf>.
- <http://www.edgroup.com.au/wp-content/uploads/2014/03/ESP-IG-Policy-Brief-Final.pdf>.
- <http://www.eesc.europa.eu/resources/docs/inclusive-governance.pdf>.
- [http://www.mcrg.ac.in/development/P\\_writing/Amit1.pdf](http://www.mcrg.ac.in/development/P_writing/Amit1.pdf).
- Jayaram, N. (2005). *On civil society: Issues and perspective*. Sage Publication, New Delhi.
- Leftwich, A. (1994). Governance, the state and the politics of development. *Development and Change*, 25(1), 363-386.
- Mohanty, R. T. (2000). *Civil society and governance a research study in India*. Ids, Sussex, UK . New Delhi: Society for Participatory Research in Asia (PRIA).
- Monditoka, A. K. (2010). *Decentralised Governance in Tribal India: Negotiating Space between the State, Community and Civil Society* (Vol. 1). New Castle, UK: Cambridge Scholar Publishing.
- Peter, M. W. (2000). Social capital: Implications for development theory, research, and policy. *The World Bank Research Observer*, 15(2), 225-249.
- Jadhav, P. (2008). Relative Disparity in the Implementation of Reservation Policy in India (With Respect To Scheduled Castes). In J. Karade, *Development of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in India* (p. 2). USA: Cambridge Publishing House.
- Srinivas, N. (2006). NGO Advocacy and Marketing: Handloom weavers in India. *Milano Wednesday Seminar Series, USA*. New York: The New School of Management and Urban Policy.
- Tsujinaka, Y. (2002). *The cultural dimension in measuring social capital: Perspectives from Japan*. OECD. Tsukuba: Institute of Social Sciences University of Tsukuba.

## (Endnotes)

- 1 Evans, Peter (1996), 'Government Action, Social Capital and Development: Reviewing the Evidence on Synergy', *World Development*, Vol. 24 (6), 1119- 1132.
- 2 Leftwich, Adrian (1994), 'Governance, the State and the Politics of Development' *Development and Change*, Vol.25, (1), 363-386
- 3 (Census of India -2011): Release of Primary Census Abstract data Highlights. P. 3.
- 4 [http://lawmin.nic.in/olwing/coi/coi-english/Const.Pock%20Pg.Rom8Fsss\(25\).pdf](http://lawmin.nic.in/olwing/coi/coi-english/Const.Pock%20Pg.Rom8Fsss(25).pdf)
- 5 <http://tribal.nic.in/Content/DefinitionProfiles.aspx>, Retrieved on 24/12/2014 at 11:00 hrs.
- 6 <http://tribal.nic.in/Content/IntroductionScheduledTribes.aspx>/Retrievedondated05/09/2014. 10:40pm
- 7 [http://www.mcrg.ac.in/development/P\\_writing/Amit1.pdf](http://www.mcrg.ac.in/development/P_writing/Amit1.pdf).
- 8 <http://www.edgroup.com.au/wp-content/uploads/2014/03/ESP-IG-Policy-Brief-Final.pdf>.
- 9 Chandoke, Neera, Civil society as the 'Third Sphere': Tandon Rajesh and Mohanty Ranjita eds. (2004): Does civil society matter? Governance in contemporary India, Sage Publication New Delhi.
- 10 Jayaram, N. (2005): On civil society; Issues and Perspective; Sage Publication, New Delhi.
- 11 <https://www.slideshare.net/saibhaskar/role-of-media-and-civil-societies-in-combating> on 27/03/2018 at 1500 hrs.
- 12 <https://www.slideshare.net/saibhaskar/role-of-media-and-civil-societies-in-combating> on 27/03/2018 at 1500 hrs.
- 13 <https://www.slideshare.net/saibhaskar/role-of-media-and-civil-societies-in-combating> on 27/03/2018 at 1500 hrs.
- 14 <https://www.learntoinfluence.com/using-social-capital-to-build-political-muscle/>retrived on 27/03/2018 at 1500 hrs.
- 15 [http://afrevjo.net/journals/multidiscipline/vol\\_8\\_no\\_1\\_art\\_14.pdf](http://afrevjo.net/journals/multidiscipline/vol_8_no_1_art_14.pdf).
- 16 <http://oaji.net/articles/2016/3041-1455606592.pdf>.
- 17 Ibid.